

VIRGINIA BAR ASSOCIATION U.S. SENATE DEBATE
The Homestead, Hot Springs, Virginia
Saturday, July 21, 2012

Candidates: **George Allen**, Former U.S. Senator, Former Virginia Governor

Tim Kaine, Former DNC Chairman, Former Virginia Governor

Moderator: **Candy Crowley**, CNN Chief Political Correspondent, Anchor "State of the Union"

THIS IS A RUSH TRANSCRIPT. THIS COPY MAY NOT BE IN ITS FINAL FORM AND MAY BE UPDATED. MAY CONTAIN TRANSCRIPTION ERRORS.

11:07

TIM KAINE (D), FORMER CHAIRMAN DNC; FORMER VIRGINIA GOVERNOR: Thank you Candy and good morning to everyone it's great to be back with you. My wife Ann and I had a unique privilege yesterday. We went to the RAM Medical Clinic in Wise County, Virginia, which is an annual event where hundreds of people gather from hundreds of miles. Ultimately thousands of people to get medical service that they lack access to in the communities where they live. Not only are there folks there from many, many states seeking medical care, but there's volunteers; Lion's Club members, dentists, physicians, and oral hygienists there showing the best of our spirits to try to help folks out. As Ann and I were working the registration booth and as we were thanking people for serving, the thought of who was a Republican and who was a Democrat didn't occur to us. We were thinking a little bit yesterday, and there was discussion among people about the horrible tragedy in Colorado. And it brought up painful memories of similar events in Virginia. The shooting at Virginia Tech five years ago, the shooting nearby at the Appalachian School of Grundy. And again as we think about the victims and their families we're not thinking about whether they're Republicans or Democrats. We have big issues that we need to tackle as a nation. There are huge needs that we need to address, and we have huge resources to address not just financially resources, but the resources of spirit and willingness to pull together as a community.

But somehow we've let our politics get very, very small, divisive and too personal. And while there's a lot of issues -- and we'll share some contrast on issues today, and that's important, I think one of the most important things for those of us running this year, whatever the race, is to try to elevate this, because the folks who are waiting in line at Wise, they deserve that of us.

And the people who come around to volunteer, to fill the gaps in the safety net, they deserve that of us. It's been my pleasure to try to serve that way, bringing people together and lifting people up. And if I have the chance to serve as a senator I'll continue to do that. Thank you.

CANDY CROWLEY, CNN HOST: Governor Allen?

GEORGE ALLEN (R), FORMER VIRGINIA GOVERNOR: Thank you. Like Tim, I think we come together this morning with heavy hearts for the victims of the tragedy in Colorado and all our prayers are with those families. Folks, for more than a year, I've had well over 200 small business roundtables, town hall meetings and various events, listening to the people of Virginia.

I've heard from so many people that Washington's policies are hurting them, their families and their businesses. They feel that their voices are being ignored by those in Washington.

And in fact, more than anything that I hear from folks, whether it's southwest Virginia or anywhere else in our commonwealth is they tell me what's needed most by people in their community are more jobs and more opportunities.

Virginians are hurting because of the failed policies in Washington which my opposite has advocated. They are an obstacle to small and big businesses to invest and create the jobs that we so desperately need. And if these policies aren't changed, the situation's going to get much worse for Virginians.

A deal that was passed last summer, which I opposed and Tim Kaine supported has us facing \$500 billion of defense cuts, cuts that will harm our military and cause severe job losses in Virginia. And, indeed, it'll be devastating to our economy. In fact, over 200,000 good-paying jobs in Virginia are at stake if Washington continues to fail to act. We cannot let this happen.

Like most Virginians, I believe a way to get our economy growing and creating jobs again is by reinvigorating the entrepreneurial spirit of our country with top positive pro-job tax regulatory energy and education policies.

This will be my priority if I'm elected senator. I know we can have a healthy economy, creating the jobs that people need without these devastating cuts. It's time to bring the voices of hardworking Virginians to Washington for a more efficient, effective and accountable government, and that's what I'll do.

CROWLEY: Do we want to move on to the question? My turn here for a little bit. And the first question is to Governor Kaine. It's something you both brought up, and that is what happened in Aurora, Colorado. We all come together in sorrow. Inevitably the gun debate comes up, and it already has.

Now looking at what we know so far, which may change, we have a young man with no known record, no known police record, an honor student, a Ph.D. candidate. He shows up at a movie theater. He's got two pistols, one of them a 9 mm Glock, a shotgun, an assault rifle and a drum magazine that's capable of firing up to 100 rounds.

He's also got tear gas canisters, all of which, we are told, he was able to purchase legally over a three-month period, and we are told that he was able to get 6,000 rounds of ammunition off the Internet.

Now the president's spokesman said yesterday what the president wants to do is protect the 2nd Amendment and the gun rights of everyone while making sure that people who shouldn't have guns don't get them.

Governor Kaine, what law is that that would have prevented Aurora, Colorado?

KAINE: You know, Candy, I had to deal with a very similar situation when I was governor, and you have the horrible shootings at Virginia Tech in April of 2012 (sic). And I remember I came back with President Bush to go to Tech and we were there at a very moving convocation service and then spent time with family members. And I walked into the popular (ph) press.

And one of the first questions someone asked me is, you know, do we need to heed the calls for changing the gun laws right away? And I really got mad at the reporter who asked me. I was tired and a little bit emotional and I just blasted him. I said, you know, let us deal with our grieving families and let us deal with our problems before you immediately try to politicize this.

And I feel a little bad; I saw what some of the comments were yesterday and I feel a little bit the same way. What we did, though, is that we stepped back and we learned and we fixed.

And we made improvements. I worked together with then-attorney general Bob McDonald, the current governor, to fix aspects of Virginia's gun laws that had

led to that problem when people were being adjudicated mentally dangerous, that information wasn't going into the background records check.

And so we need to learn and fix and get more intelligence and find out a way to fix some of the problems that led to this. I, for one, believe we need to do background records checks when guns are purchased at gun shows, because if we don't, we let people get guns who shouldn't.

And I was also very disappointed this year when a signature law that was a bipartisan accomplishment of Governor Wilder and the Republican U.S. attorney, Richard Collins (ph), the limitation of one handgun a month purchase was allowed to expire. So we need to learn and we need to fix.

CROWLEY: And Governor Allen, you have 90 seconds to respond, agree with, disagree with what Governor Kaine said.

ALLEN: Well, in some part I agree and some I have a slight different view. But on the most part, I'm in agreement. One Tim, while you were serving as governor that terrible tragedy hit the Virginia Tech campus on April 16th. All Virginians came together.

The president came together, you did and I thought you did an outstanding job in a time of tragedy. And all Virginians and regardless of where somebody went to college in Virginia, or elsewhere reunited.

And really admired everything that everyone did in that very good community and that's the first thing I thought of when I started hearing about what happened in Aurora, Colorado. And thought if my daughter was here that she might go to a movie theater and so forth. So all of us as parents think of this in a very personal way.

I think we need to determine the facts what's going on, what happened. You listed some of them. Right now, there are law enforcement people at last I thought that was going into this person's -- this murderer's home and that there may be booby traps. So let's get all the facts before we start getting into political matters. I am for criminal records checks.

When I was a member of the general assembly at Mr. Jefferson's (ph) feet, and I (inaudible) my amendment that says that when anybody's buying a firearm that they'll be, regardless of the firearm, that there will be an instant criminal records check.

And I do think those criminal records check, including mental disorders or drug abuse are indicated, and any firearm purchases. But I think we need to wait to get all the facts and then make decisions as to what can be done when such an aberrant act occurs.

CROWLEY: Governor Kaine, you have a minute to respond to that. But let me see if I can get you directly to the question. Knowing what we know now, are there enough gun laws we could impose that would stop someone from doing this if they have a clean record

KAINE: Well, it would be (inaudible) to say we can put a policy in place that would keep bad things from happening. Bad things are going to happen. We can't stop them. But what we should try to do is learn and fix them and then minimize the chances of these things happening. I'm pleased to hear George and I stand here and agree on background records checks.

People can go into gun shows and buy weapons now and they could be felons. They could be under a domestic violence protective order. They could criminally ill (ph), adjudicated and dangerous. And yet they could get these weapons and do horrible things.

Records checks are not even really a new law. The only way to enforce the existing law and the fact that, I'm a little surprised, the fact that we agree on that is a good thing. We do need to get more facts on the issue of the magazines and the kinds of weapons.

You know, I'm a proud supporter of the 2nd Amendment. I worked with colleagues at my law firm as the legal counsel on the effort when the amendment was made to protect Virginia's right to hunt fish (ph). Senator (inaudible), I think, was the key sponsor of that. He's right here in the room.

And I worked as a lawyer to help that succeed. But the kinds of weapons and ammunition just used to mete (ph) out, you know, pain and death on scores of people, you know, we ought to be reasonable about that.

CROWLEY: Senator Allen, let's take a 90-degree turn. And you can use your time as you want to --

ALLEN: Let me just, for a point of clarification, since you're asking an added question to it, I ought to get some time to answer your added question.

I do think there ought to be a criminal records checks from licensed firearms dealers. So that is the distinction there, I don't want to mislead and have my opposite on that. I don't think what the -- this person, as you laid out the facts, bought these firearms from licensed firearms dealers.

We will need to learn more and there maybe needs to -- may have needed to be, as we find out more about this person and his motivation, of reporting that so that it shows up on a criminal records check. But the solution's not to take away the rights of law-abiding citizens to protect themselves or their families.

CROWLEY: OK. Governor, let me turn you 180 degrees here. I want to talk about the economy.

We have a number of questions from this audience that dealt with the fiscal cliff that you referred to in your opening statement, and the nation's mounting debt, was the famous moment in the Republican primary when all the Republican candidates on the stage were asked, would you agree to a tax increase if you were assured it was going to be accompanied by spending cuts worth 10 times the amount of the tax increase? They all said no. What do you say?

ALLEN: I'll say what I heard from a small business owner in Bedford, and I asked him, "What would you like to see the federal government do? And he told me that "I'd like to see the government get off my back and out of my pockets." And I couldn't have said it better myself.

After seeing so much waste of the taxpayers' money in Washington, why should Washington, why should the federal government take even more? I'm -- I would want to go to Washington to actually protect hardworking taxpayers.

We need a government that is more efficient, is more effective, is focused on its priorities and accountable. And I think that we ought to have a tax code that is more simple, more fair and more competitive.

Right now the federal government imposes the worst in the world, highest tax on job creating businesses in the world. It ought to be a lower, flatter, more simple tax. That'll create jobs. My perspective is raising taxes will only create more job losses. Raising taxes do not create more jobs except maybe at the IRS.

CROWLEY: Is that a no to the direct question of you've got a deal of 10 times as many spending cuts as the tax increase, you wouldn't take that deal?

ALLEN: I've seen these deals in the past, and what happens, they keep spending.

CROWLEY: So no?

ALLEN: They keep spending and there are fewer jobs. What we need is a more simple, fair and competitive tax system in our country. That's what I want to work on in the United States Senate, not finding ways to take more money out of hardworking taxpayers and small business owners.

CROWLEY: I'm already blowing a hole in the rules, but that's a no?

ALLEN: Yes, that's pretty obvious.

CROWLEY: OK.

(LAUGHTER)

CROWLEY: OK. You guys got it? All right. OK, thank you.

Governor Kaine, your chance to respond to anything that --

KAINE: Yes. I have a very different view. I've cut a lot of taxes as mayor, utility taxes, business license taxes, real estate taxes as governor, worked on the deal to eliminate the estate tax in Virginia so hundreds of thousands of working Virginians off the income tax rolls. But you -- and I've done a lot of expense cuts. But we do need more revenue to solve this problem.

How do we get into this fiscal cliff situation? We got into it by doing two things wrong. First there was significant fiscal irresponsibility in Washington, and much of it occurred when George Allen was serving in the U.S. Senate.

Dramatically expanding Medicare without paying for it, waging two wars without paying for it, tax cuts without paying for them, making them temporary, now saying we're going to make them permanent, fiscal irresponsibility hurdles.

Second, there was a my way or the highway attitude. When people were trying to work out a deal last summer, George is one of the people standing against Governor McDonald and Eric Cantor and U.S. Chamber of Commerce saying no, we should use the debt ceiling vote as a leverage to try to get more cuts. He wanted more cuts than he got last summer

And that's why we are where we are today. What we need to do is we need to grow the economy by leveling the playing field for small businesses, by talent (ph) investment and infrastructure. We need to make significant cuts and I know how to make them. And we also need to let the Bush tax cuts expire at the top end.

If we let the Bush tax cuts expire over \$500,000, it will -- it will produce deficit reduction of about \$600 billion over the next 10 years, and it would be the right thing to do.

CROWLEY: OK.

(CROSSTALK)

CROWLEY: Governor Allen you have a minute to respond.

ALLEN: Yes. My view of governing and taxes cannot be more different. Tim as governor tried to raise taxes by \$4 billion, including on people who were earning as little as \$17,000 a year. Now the tax cuts that we passed that I advocated in 2001 and 2003 actually spurred job growth. Lower taxes help create more jobs, make the country more competitive for investment.

And, indeed, if you look back in those years, the job growth increased through our country. We were hit on 9/11 with a horrendous attack. We needed to respond to the security needs of our country. We needed to support our troops in the field and we also needed to avert a recession. And those tax cuts that we passed helped spur economic growth.

Raising taxes does not make a state or a country more competitive for investment in jobs. And I'm going to be one in Washington who's going to be looking out for the hardworking taxpayers of Virginia and America. And that's a bit different than Tim's record.

CROWLEY: We want to move into part one of the two times that you all will get to question and respond to one another, and Governor Allen, you start off with your question for Governor Kaine.

ALLEN: Tim, you just criticized me for opposing the deal passed last summer that would be devastating to thousands of Virginia families. That deal that you supported, which was entrusting another committee, a super committee to propose spending cuts. Predictably, like so many of these other commissions in Washington, it failed. The result? Disproportionate defense cuts -

11:24

KAINE: George, the deal was the right thing to do, as Governor McDonnell said, as Eric Cantor said, as the US Chamber of Commerce said, because the deal cut a trillion dollars out of federal spending. 15:14:20

Now, when you were in the Senate, you didn't do any cuts. You ratcheted up federal spending, you increased the debt ceiling, you voted to increase your own pay. You helped turn massive surpluses into massive deficits. 15:14:32

The first part of the sequestration deal that was passed last summer was to cut a trillion dollars of spending, and you were opposed to it. The second part was to try to find a way to deal with our budget crisis going forward, and you said you were opposed to it because it didn't cut enough. You said, "We need to use this debt ceiling vote as leverage -- as leverage to try to get more cuts out of Congress." 15:14:56

In the aftermath of the deal, America's credit rating was downgraded for the first time that I'm aware of, and it was downgraded because S&P said the spectre of national leaders threatening brinksmanship over a debt ceiling vote makes us so unconfident about leadership that we're going to downgrade the vote. 15:15:18

Now, when you were in the Senate, you voted to increase the debt ceiling all the time, four times when you were a Senator. You resisted efforts to condition that upon pay-go principles. So, if you were going to pay -- you didn't want to have to pay for what you were spending. 15:15:31

And last year, if we had followed you, we wouldn't have just gotten a bond rating downgrade. America would have defaulted on its credit for the first time in our history. 15:15:41

What we need to do. And, I stated this at the top. This is a time where we really have to elevate what we do, because the challenges are significant. Standing out advocating fiscally irresponsible practices as fighting a deal or trying to get leverage over the other side to cut more is, is not what we need right now. We need people to come together and try to find a deal. And, I believe Congress can still find a deal to avoid the needs for cuts that will try and jeopardize our nations defense. They're getting paid, they should do their job. And thank goodness Mark Warner and others in the gang of six are working to try to find a path forward that will avoid these cuts.

CROWLEY: Governor Allen, want to add?

ALLEN: Well, the deal had no spending caps, there was no balanced budget amendment, no line-item veto authority, nothing in it.

What was going to happen is if nothing happened from the commission is that half the cuts out of that trillion dollars, \$500 billion was going to come from the paramount responsibility of the federal government, which is national defense. You could see that coming.

I could never envision myself voting for something that could be so potentially harmful for Virginia. Now, you mentioned Republicans who supported it. Well, those Republicans, the difference between them and you, Tim, is that they have proposed ideas to stop these devastating cuts.

They have talked about comprehensive tax reform, ideas that will not have these cuts being so draconian and harmful to our military readiness as well as Virginians. And so, we need to be putting Virginians first, as far as I'm concerned, and I have a track record of doing so.

And national defense should never be used as a bargaining tool to raise taxes, and I'll be that type of senator for the people of Virginia.

CROWLEY: Governor Allen, let me continue with you on the idea of cuts and -- versus taxes. A member of our audience -- actually, several members wanted me to ask you all, what specific cuts would you make?

And let's take -- we all know the defense budget and entitlements are two huge expenditures for the federal government. What specific big cut would you make in the defense department to help bring down --

ALLEN: Well, in defense?

CROWLEY: In defense.

ALLEN: In defense -- well, first of all, in every single federal government agency, there can be savings found. None of them are running as efficiently as possible.

Our national defense, in my view, leadership is setting priorities and getting others to agree to those goals. And clearly, national defense is a primary responsibility of the federal government.

I think that their ideas, for example, modeling and simulation for training, I think is much more efficient, it's more effective, it's also safer as opposed to the amount of fuel that's used and some of the injuries or deaths that can be caused in it.

I also think that we ought to be, while upgrading our navy with aircraft carriers and nuclear submarines, I do think unmanned aerial vehicles can have a more prominent role. We do need to upgrade our aircraft.

I remember going to Iraq and seeing -- flying in with pilots who were younger than the planes they were flying. Those planes are still being flown, and they're worn out by the dust and the grit and the sand of Iraq and Afghanistan.

So, we do need to upgrade the equipment of our men and women serving our country, but I think there are smarter uses of technology, whether it's modeling and simulation as well as unmanned aerial vehicles that can help reduce that cost.

But we do need to keep our promises to our veterans and their families for the benefits they've earned. Those are -- deferred compensation, they've earned it, and we should keep our promises to our veterans.

CROWLEY: Since he brought it up, would you respond to this, how about the idea of new people coming into the service having different sorts of less-expensive promises than the pensions currently provided to them?

KAINE: The problem with that, Candy, and I'll talk generally about defense cuts, too, is if you start to scrimp on the benefits and compensation for folks in the military, you can affect the quality of people you get in.

The military's a talent pool. The people who are going to put it all on the line for you every day, you want to make sure that you train and recruit and equip and provide benefits for that talent pool so that you've got the talent pool that you need.

And so, you could maybe save some dollars if you change some of the compensation or pension practices, but at what cost? We need to keep our nation's defense strong.

Now, I also see that there are some ways to save on the defense side. One that George mentioned, I agree with. The use of technology has a way over leveraging and reducing payroll costs. So, right now, in Newport News, the Virginians -- this is something we can all feel good about -- Virginians build the largest manufactured items on the planet Earth: nuclear aircraft carriers.

And we're building the Ford-class carrier, a new Ford-class carrier in Newport News, replacing the Nimitz-class carriers. And a new carrier will operate with 1300 fewer sailors, which will save \$5 billion over the life of the carrier.

I also think we provide a lot of defense for Europe because of the Cold War that we don't need to provide anymore. I don't think we should be paying and letting other nations outsource their defense cost to us. And so, those would be some ways that I would look to find savings.

Leon Panetta, the Secretary of Defense, says we can find savings, but let us find savings, Congress, don't tell us what you think we need to do. Let the Joint Chiefs of Staff and the services make the right decisions about where we can find savings.

ALLEN: The -- Secretary Panetta has also said that these cuts from this sequestration, this failed debt ceiling deal from last year, would be devastating. There's already going to be nearly \$500 billion in cuts to armed services. That's before this failed deal that Tim Kaine supported.

11:32

(Audio gap)

11:42

ALLEN: -- Tim's point of view, which is more regulations, more taxes. And the biggest savings we could do is get rid of this health care tax law that is a real impediment on jobs in our economy.

KAINE: George, your record is a big spending record. I mean, you say that the trajectory was moving positively. The last time we debated, we stood on stage together, and you said, "You're right. Spending was a big problem when I was in the Senate."

And you were right there at the center of the problem. You voted on those bills I mentioned earlier without paying for them. You voted to turn surpluses to deficits. You voted four times to raise your own pay. You voted four times to raise the debt limit. You voted six times against any pay-go restrictions.

You voted for 52,000 earmarks, adding up to \$120 billion-worth of spending. And you acknowledged last time, spending was a problem. Your strategy is talking in one way, as a fiscal conservative, and then getting in and spending in ways that have continued to hurt the economy.

One of the reasons the deficit is high today is because you planted time bombs in the budget. Medicare Part D, unfunded wars, tax cuts. You put those all in, and they're continuing to be a wrecking ball in our fiscal situation today. We have to have people in who know how to make decisions to get this under control.

CROWLEY: Governor Allen, you're getting the next question here, and I want to take a turn. Because the fact of the matter is that both of you queue pretty closely to your party line, and what Democrats think, what Republicans think, and the number of the questions that we got from this audience has to do with bipartisanship.

Why can't these guys come to some meeting of the minds somewhere to bring down this debt, to bring down this deficit, to bring down the unemployment rate.

So, I've noticed, Governor Allen, as I'm sure everybody has, that you have run some ads about how Governor Kaine will be President Obama's senator and not Virginia's senator.

And I wonder -- it got me thinking about your relationship with Governor Romney. What major policy differences do you anticipate that you'd be willing to break with Governor Romney?

ALLEN: Well, first let me answer the other aspects of it. Yes, we're in two different parties, two different philosophies. We -- I think Republicans generally speaking trust free people and free enterprise. I don't like limits or restrictions on people unless they're harming someone else.

And I like decisions being made closest to the people, if possible. National defense, though, is a matter for the federal government.

We have two different points of view. I've worked with Democrats in the past. When I was governor, the Democrats controlled the General Assembly. We cut taxes by over \$600 million. We reformed welfare, we made our communities safer with the abolition of parole and truth in sentencing.

And over 300,000 net new jobs were created in Virginia while I was governor. While Tim Kaine was governor, he was trying to raise taxes by \$4 billion, tuition -- it was balanced, we balanced the budget. They did it on the backs of students, who had to pay over 30 percent higher tuition rates while he was governor. And over 100,000 jobs were lost in Virginia while he was governor.

Now, on Mitt Romney, there'll be times where I don't agree with my fellow Republicans. I just didn't agree with them when they had the bridge to nowhere. I was one of 15 who voted against that.

I had disagreements with fellow Republicans on an initiative I worked for several years, and it's finally gotten through, and that is funding for historically black colleges and universities to upgrade their technology so they can attract the faculty and make sure that the students at historically black colleges and other minority-serving institutions can get the training they need to get the technology-proficient jobs that are out there in the market.

So, my first priority is not going to be agreements and disagreements with anyone. My first priority is going to be the hardworking taxpayers of Virginia.

CROWLEY: Governor Allen, the question -- I'm sorry, Governor Kaine, the question was about bipartisanship -

KAINE: Too many governors up here.

(CROSSTALK)

CROWLEY: I said two governors, and I thought it would be easier to call you --

ALLEN: And I called Governor Romney part of it --

CROWLEY: -- it doesn't turn out that way. Bipartisanship, and --

KAINE: Yes, let me jump in on that.

CROWLEY: -- and breaking with the party line.

KAINE: Sure. Sure. I broke with the president in the last ten days. I think the Bush tax cuts should expire over \$500,000, not over \$250,000. I said early in the campaign, the president should not have committed American forces to Libya without a vote of Congress.

I complained when the president, in crafting the contraception coverage to the Affordable Care Act, didn't provide a robust enough exception for religious organizations. I publicly complained, and the White House changed it. I'm very happy --

KAINE: Senator Romney -- or Governor Romney. I agree -- I think Romneycare's OK. So, I'll agree with a Republican.

George and I have a very different MO in terms of these issues of bipartisanship. I think many in the room who have been in Virginia politics for a while remember his famous quote when he was governor, "My job is to knock Democrats' soft teeth down their whining throats."

When he ran for Senate in 2000, he encouraged Republicans -- "We've got to save our venom -- save our venom -- to use against our opponents, the Democrats." I don't think Republicans are my opponents. We've got to compete against China and India, not against each other.

George, as a governor, called General Assembly members "dinosaurs," "monarchical elitists," frequently name-called John Kerry and Hillary Clinton when he served with them in the Senate.

During this campaign, he continues it. He calls federal employees "sanctimonious social engineers," and he's got a billboard up that says, "Tim Kaine: Obama's senator, not Virginia's," as if somehow I'm not a real Virginian because I support the president of the United States.

That's yesterday's politics. We're not going to solve our problems if we continue down the path of smash-mouth, consider the other side the opponent. We've got to compete against the world to win.

CROWLEY: We should say, Governor Allen, that your smashing teeth remark you did say was not literal. But go ahead and --

(LAUGHTER)

ALLEN: It's an example of where sports analogies are not appropriate, and that was a mistake on my part for it.

The working -- working with the other party, Tim, you were able to bring Republicans and Democrats together as governor. Each and every one of them,

even the one who sponsored your tax increase, voted against it. It was, I think, a 97 to 0 vote.

And you do have to work with folks in the other party, and I did. As governor, I went through the list -- I'll not repeat it again -- of really big, monumental changes we made.

In the US Senate, you mentioned Hillary -- Senator Clinton at the time. Now, Secretary of State. We actually went together on what's called the Shine Act, and this is screening for infants to make sure that we're screening for maladies or diseases so there's better treatment.

John Kerry and I really don't agree on many issues, but we did agree on wifi. There's other senators who we rarely agreed, but we worked together to keep taxes off internet access and on the national nanotechnology initiative, of which I was a leader, as well as cyber security.

So, you find folks on specific issues on the other side of the aisle to join with you to get things done, and that's what I aim to do on energy, on technology issues, and national security issues.

And also, I think there is a basis of support for a more fair, simple tax system. Tim mentions the Bush tax cuts. Even President Bush says it's a shame they're called the Bush tax cuts, because Democrats naturally recoil at that.

I would hope that we could come together -- I'm proposing 20 percent. Others are proposing higher, some lower. I think there's a basis for a consensus, and I want to be at the table hammering it out to get America more competitive for investment and jobs.

CROWLEY: And now to you, Governor Kaine, a lot of talk about split tickets, now, about how you are trying to appeal to those Romney voters to split their ticket and come with you.

So, you were talking about a candidate who wants to undo Obamacare, who does not want to raise taxes on the wealthy, and who thinks the president's done a lousy job in foreign policy. What is your pitch to the person who makes that vote, to then vote for you, who agrees with all those things the president did?

KAINE: Well, I would just say it's track record. I was governor under President Bush for three years and under President Obama for one year. And I disagreed a lot with President Bush, but we worked together in the aftermath of Virginia Tech, which his cabinet secretaries Gonzales and Spellings and Leavitt to make some fixes that would help campus security around the nation.

And I worked very closely with President Bush and his Secretary of Transportation to try to get funding for rail to Dulles. And I worked closely with my Republican legislative leadership. Virginia was the best state for business in America all four years I was governor.

"Forbes" magazine best-managed state in America. "Governing" magazine, "Education Week's" best state to raise a child. That didn't happen because of me, it happened because we could work together.

The other reason that I think I can attract some voters who might split tickets is I don't go around bashing Mitt Romney. I would never put up a bulletin board that would say "George Allen, Romney's senator, not Virginia's."

I don't think George is anti-Virginian for supporting Mitt Romney. I support President Obama, but I'm not going to spend time trashing Mitt Romney as a candidate. That's not the way I do things. Instead, I'm going to be talking

about the strategies to grow the economy, the strategies to master our challenges abroad.

The reason -- the principle difference between George Allen and me are two: real fiscal responsibility versus words, and smash-mouth try to take the other side down at every opportunity versus, hey, let's work together. My father-in-law's a former Republican governor of Virginia. It starts at home in my house.

(LAUGHTER)

CROWLEY: Governor Allen, if you'd like to make a pitch to Obama voters or --

ALLEN: Sure.

CROWLEY: -- respond to Governor Kaine?

ALLEN: Well, we do have records. And what I hear from most people throughout Virginia is the concern about jobs and the economy for their families and others in their community.

Be both have records. My view is we need to motivate and inspire people to positive, constructive, proven solutions that will work.

Lower taxes, prompt permitting, reasonable regulations, productive energy policy, and empowering education are what we put into effect while I was governor, and something I've advocated in and out of government. And the net result, your proof, your scoreboard, is over 300,000 net new jobs created during my term as governor.

Tim talks about raising taxes. He talks about being a well-managed state. I don't see what's great management where you're shutting down rest areas around Virginia while there's a billion dollars sitting in a VDOT account being unused while you're trying to stampede the legislature into higher taxes.

The reality is, is what campaigns are about, I think, are not running down the others. There's contrasts. There's -- and that's what we have in competitive, representative democracy, contrasting or competing ideas.

We're running on our blueprint for America's comeback. It's a pro-jobs growth plan of action. In the event that the people of Virginia hire me on, I'll say, "This is what the people of Virginia voted for me to do."

And I think I can be very influential, because we're a pivotal state, in saying this is what Virginians are for, similar to when I ran for governor on an agenda that I'd already explained. And that helped, working with the Democratic-controlled legislature, to get these ideas through that made Virginia safer and a more prosperous place to live, learn, work, and to raise our families.

KAINE: George, you may say that campaigns aren't about running other people down, but that's just always what you do. And you continue to do it to the day. You --

ALLEN: You ought to watch our ads.

KAINE: -- you talked about working with Hillary Clinton. Here's what you said about Hillary Clinton when you were a colleague of hers. "She's so contrary to all of our values, our principles, and our ideals."

You said repeatedly, "I'd rather be with George Bush drinking beer than middling cheese and wine with Hillary Clinton at her mansion." You called George -- John Kerry "an elite Massachusetts liberal who does not embrace the values we hold dear in Virginia."

And these are just senators you served with. Wow, I'd hate to hear what you said about people you weren't serving with. And you're the one with the billboards up in Virginia, "Tim Kaine: Obama's senator, not Virginia's."

I just say this. I'll make this pledge to all of you. I am going to be a partner with whoever is the president of the United States. I was a partner with President Bush, I've been a partner with President Obama, working to help get the carrier move canceled to Florida.

I'll be a partner with President Obama or a President Romney. I will not define myself as an obstructionist to the other party or as an obstructionist to the chief executive. I'll be a partner, it's the way I've done it, it's the way I'm going to do it.

CROWLEY: Governor Allen, let me turn you to health care. You've said frequently on the campaign trail that you want to be that last vote of the --

ALLEN: Deciding vote.

CROWLEY: -- second to --

ALLEN: If we're going to have my quotes, get it right, unlike Tim, getting the wrong dates for my quotes.

CROWLEY: -- to undo Obamacare, in any case, and replace it with what? Is there anything in Obamacare that you think ought to, the day it comes undone, be put back in place?

ALLEN: Yes -- Tim has been the hand -- was the hand-picked chairman of the Democratic National Committee by President Obama, and he's, in effect, the hand-packed senator and recruited to run from the president.

(CROSSTALK)

KAINE: That's -- I am highly offended at that.

ALLEN: Here in Virginia -- well --

KAINE: I am campaigning --

ALLEN: -- you'll have your time.

KAINE: I am campaigning --

ALLEN: You can resign --

KAINE: -- full-time for 19 months --

ALLEN: I didn't recruit you.

KAINE: -- on my own, with the support of my family. For you to say that I'm hand-picked by somebody else rather than doing it myself is completely out of line. And it proves the point that I just made. He cannot help himself.

CROWLEY: Governor Kaine --

KAINE: He cannot help himself.

CROWLEY: Watch it, you guys.

ALLEN: Well, the --

CROWLEY: OK --

ALLEN: Reclaiming my time with it. Tim, you have -

11:56

GEORGE ALLEN (R), FORMER VIRGINIA GOVERNOR: Tim, you have said that ObamaCare is, quote, "a great achievement." I've heard from so many Virginians, whether they're small businesses, what an impediment that is to hiring more people on.

I heard from a woman in Virginia Beach a few weeks ago that many employers -- and she's heard it from her husband's employer -- that they're looking to pay the fine -- excuse me; the tax rather than provide health insurance.

So this was promised by advocates such as President Obama and Tim Kaine that this -- people wouldn't lose their insurance; they wouldn't lose -- they'd have lower premiums. They'd be able to see the doctors that they had been seeing. None of this is actually being the case.

Now I do want to be the deciding vote to repeal this health care tax law. Tim Kaine thinks it's a great achievement. Now what should it be replaced with? Because I don't think the health care system before this tax law, health care tax law went into effect.

One, I think one of the things that is actually a very good idea in it is allowing children up to age 26 to stay on their parents' policies. This is unfortunately more needed than ever because the job market for young people graduating from college is the worst it's been since World War II. So that makes sense.

I also think health savings accounts are -- matter a lot and that would be a good idea. Another good idea would allow small businesses to band together across state lines and have an opportunity to more affordable and more choice and more competition and I do think the states ought to have more flexibility in running the Medicaid program.

CANDY CROWLEY, CNN HOST: Governor Kaine, you have 90 seconds to rebut. But let me just say that these people are carefully keeping time so that when runs over, I don't want to rat you out. But when you --

(CROSSTALK)

CROWLEY: -- either one of you runs over, the other one picks up the time.

TIM KAINE (D), FORMER CHAIRMAN DNC; FORMER VIRGINIA GOVERNOR: Great. Well, George and I do have a different view on the Affordable Care Act, and George wants to be the first vote, his first vote would like to be a vote to repeal what he calls the ObamaCare monstrosity. What I gather is he would like his first vote to be the 34th vote so far to try to repeal the Affordable Care Act.

And I think it's foolish to keep looking in the rearview mirror. To tackle the problems we have as a nation yesterday isn't sufficient. We've got to focus on tomorrow. Repealing the Affordable Care Act would mean that kids would get kicked off family policies if they're 21 to 26, and that's hundreds of thousands of kids in Virginia.

It would mean that 20 million American seniors would lose free preventative care under Medicare and the ability to get help on buying prescription drugs. It would mean that hundreds of thousands of small businesses would have a tax credit taken away from them to help them buy health insurance for their employees.

It would mean that insurance companies could continue to plug you because of preexisting condition or pull your policy out from under you because of rescission. It would mean that women would no longer have the ability to

expect contraception coverage as part of an employer health care plan. When George wants to repeal health care, that's what he wants to do.

I'm going to fight to keep those things, and I'm going to fight to make it better with more cost savings mechanisms. George was in the Senate and could have done something about health care.

What he did during his time in the Senate is we saw the number of uninsured in this country grow by over 8 million people and premiums that families and businesses were experiencing grew by over 70 percent. We don't need to go back to that. We need to make fixes and go forward and not throw out these good provisions that are benefiting Virginians' lives.

CROWLEY: I've got time for one more round of questions

(CROSSTALK)

ALLEN: I've got rebuttals to this.

CROWLEY: Oh, I'm sorry.

ALLEN: The reality is premiums have increased since this measure was passed by \$2,500. Medicare is going to be cut by \$500 billion. The taxes that are being imposed on medical device manufacturers is going to mean higher taxes and fewer jobs, fewer research and development here.

I was in Chester (ph), Virginia, at a company, Merit (ph) Medical, who said we're going to be taxed an extra \$5 billion to \$10 billion, which means less research and development, less spending, obviously. And they have -- they're a Utah-based company, but they're also in the Netherlands and France.

And the owner, the CEO said the tax laws in France were better than what they're going to have imposed on them because of ObamaCare.

So I think that folks deserve better than what they're having to get now with the cuts in Medicare, the impediment for hiring jobs, the taxes that are involved in it. We need to have people making decisions with their doctors rather than having Washington bureaucrats dictating health care choices for the people of Virginia and America.

CROWLEY: Governor Kaine, my last question for this before you all get to ask questions of each other again -- and I won't forget you next time -- is a national question with a local angle. Couple of weeks ago, big windstorm comes through Virginia in the metropolitan area of Maryland, 1.2 million homes in Virginia went without power.

Some of them were out for a whole week. Power lines went down, traffic lights were knocked out, hospitals were knocked off the grid. Some -- in some areas in northern Virginia for sure the 9/11 (sic) system was knocked out for a couple of days, at least in parts of it. So you're a former governor. You are a candidate for senator.

When you look at this, I will tell you what my friends said, who live in Virginia and who live in Maryland, can you imagine what would happen if a terrorist attacked, if we can't sort of sustain a windstorm and the 9/11 (sic) goes -- the 9-1-1 number goes out, does it give you pause about how ready we actually would be in a major metropolitan area, which is certainly a target, as we know, for another attack? And is there something you could do about it if you became senator?

KAINE: Yes, great question, Candy, and what I found as governor -- and I imagine George had a similar experience -- is a lot of areas that I was working in, you could manage, you could say to your team, look, we're in the

worst recession since the 1930s, but I want to make sure our unemployment rate's one of the lowest in the nation and our median income stays high.

And there's a measure, and you can measure to it. Or we're 15th in the nation in crime. I want to get so that we're one of the safest 10, not 15th. And you can measure to it.

The thing that you can never really measure to in a way that makes you sleep well at night is what will happen if...tomorrow in the event of emergency. Might be a weather emergency; might be some kind of a terrorist incident. You always go to sleep when you're governor, a little bit nervous about are we ready. Now we tried to survey our own vulnerabilities as a state.

Was there enough shelter space to evacuate, you know, hurricane -- in the event of a hurricane in Hampton Roads? Did we have the road infrastructure in the right way so that people could evacuate? We've got to do a comprehensive survey of what we need to do to respond to concerns, and then try to position to be in place.

I happen to believe that, as a nation, we are not spending enough on infrastructure. Some of you may have seen that Virginia, which has been getting best state for business by a number of the publications recently got downgraded by CNBC to third from first for one reason: underinvestment in transportation infrastructure.

So whether it's transportation or utility or broadband or preparedness, I do have a worry that, as a nation, we're not stepping up. That's why I fought so hard for projects like rails to Dulles and others. I want to build things again. That's great for the economy; it hires people. It helps the economy grow for decades. But we need to do that for preparedness. We need to do that to grow the economy.

ALLEN: Two points, one, I'd -- one of the things that we saw after 9/11 -- and our family was up in northern Virginia, just moved up there, days before -- is that firefighters, first responders, were all rushing in to the Pentagon.

And they had no idea what they're getting into, what that acrid smoke was. And many of them were first responders from Arlington, Fairfax and elsewhere in northern Virginia. There were also some from D.C. and from Maryland.

One of the things we saw -- and I was a leader in it -- was what we called CAPWIN (ph). And it was the Capitol-area wireless integrated network to make sure that first responders were able to communicate with one another. And it needs to be mobile.

You need redundancy in communications because all -- in 9/11, we saw how cell phones were all clogged up. It even happens in tragedies such as at Virginia Tech, where the cell phone service was overloaded. So you need to have that redundancy, particularly for the first responders, law enforcement and the rescue folks. And so that's, in my view, what the government in a regional way can work on.

Now as far as infrastructure is concerned, yes. Infrastructure is important. Tim did have an appointee to the Metropolitan Washington Airports Authority, though, who's a union official, who has wasted tons of -- tons of money which is increased in the cost to the toll roads users.

And Tim, I would hope you would ask this individual to resign and not waste a bunch of attorneys' fees fighting Governor McDonald's dismissal of him from it, because discriminating against Virginia workers for those jobs is not the right way to go and giving jobs to workers from outside of the state because you want to favor your union allies.

CROWLEY: Let me give him a chance here to respond.

KAINE: I knew George could find something wrong with a major transportation investment. But I repeat what I said earlier, as a nation and as a commonwealth, we are not building enough. And rail develops (ph) was a great example. It was a project that had been on the drawing board during many governors' terms, including Governor Allen.

But we got it off the drawing board and it's being built now and it's employing people. And it's going to provide transportation solutions, not only to Dulles rail travel -- Dulles Airport travelers, but to the entire region. And this is what we need to do for the economy. We have to level the playing field for small businesses so that they can succeed, so that they're treated fairly in taxes.

We have big businesses that pay -- no taxes and small businesses who do. We need to invest in talent and infrastructure. And then we need to solve these budget issues, Candy, that we talked about earlier, as the right way, not the wrong way.

The all-cuts approach, the budget balance that George Allen has outlined after taking the Grover Norquist pledge, would be devastating to Virginia and devastating to the national economy. Infrastructure spending is part of making America's economy stronger.

CROWLEY: OK. Now your second opportunity to ask one another questions, and Governor Kaine, you get to ask the first question.

KAINE: George, you proposed to, at the federal level, pass personhood legislation that would define life as beginning at conception and granting all rights of persons from that moment forward. Why would you claim to be a small government guy and propose what would be such a dramatic reach into people's personal lives and moral decisions?

ALLEN: Well, one of the things you said on this issue often, Tim, is that it is about contraceptives. And I would never want to ban contraceptives. This is about protecting an unborn child and its mother.

I think that as -- here's the -- will be the impact of this, that the pregnant mother is attacked and she's injured and moreover her unborn child is injured, I think the criminal ought to be held accountable for not only attacking the pregnant mother, but also the unborn child.

And that's why I look at this as very close to the bill I cosponsored, was Unborn Victims of Violence Act that -- and I believe that criminals ought to be held accountable for their crime. Now, Tim, as I've mentioned, I've traveled throughout Virginia listening to people. And the issue that comes up is not this.

What comes up is issues about jobs and what are you going to do to make sure there's more opportunities for families? That's why (inaudible) America's comeback, our blueprint that'll get our country more competitive for investment and jobs. And, indeed, energy's part of it, from the coal fields to our coast.

And in fact, on day one, you asked what am I going to do on day one, on day one, if I'm hired by y'all to represent you in Washington, I'm going to introduce a bill to allow us in Virginia to produce oil and natural gas off our coast. And then use those royalties for roads and transportation and not have every project labor agreement that discriminate against non-union workers as your folks did on the IMLAW (ph) board, on the Dulles toll road, which will make people pay higher tolls.

Now I made jobs number one as my claim on time, my claim of my time as governor. And we were able to create over 300,000 new jobs, not us, but our

condition in the private sector. Your approach, though, Tim, has been to raise -- to try to raise taxes, to raise tuition and Virginians lost over 100,000 jobs while you were governor.

And so I think you should put the aisles will put the people of Virginia first and foremost in my mind in every decision I make is what's in the best interest of the hardworking taxpaying families of Virginia.

KAINE: And, George, I did exactly the same thing. The difference between our governor terms is that you were governor in one of the longest expansions of the national economy that Bill Clinton -- he was a heck of a president -- I was governor during the worst recession since the 1930s, a recession largely pushed because of the kinds of fiscally irresponsible policies you were promoting as a U.S. senator.

And so, sure. I had to govern in a very, very tough time. But I kept Virginia's unemployment rate one of the lowest in the nation. I kept our median income one of the highest in the nation. I think our GDP relative to other states was actually better when I was governor than when George was governor. I have some scar tissue from governing in tough times, and I happen to think it's going to come in handy up in Washington.

I asked you the question about personhood, because I also believe that what people want to focus on is jobs and the economy.

But you have a track record of pushing divisive social legislation, whether it's the personhood bill, whether it's not standing up against these mandatory ultrasounds, whether it's voting against the family medical leave act, whether it's trying to support a Blunt amendment that would take contraception coverage away from women or being against paycheck fairness for men and women. You pursue these agendas that hurt women in the economy, and I would have a very different approach as a senator.

CROWLEY: Governor Allen, we are at the point where --

(CROSSTALK)

CROWLEY: -- yes, you've got a minute sorry.

ALLEN: OK. Look, we've heard this rhetoric before from you, Tim. Let's look at the reality. I'm not running on those issues. I'm running on jobs. Now you talk about budget cuts. But Virginia, at the end of your term, had a larger state workforce than at the beginning of your term. You talked about sound management. But an audit found over \$1 billion sitting in VDOT accounts at the very time you were pleading for more taxes and closing rest stops and pleading poverty.

You, in my view, through it all, saw the -- had the increase in tuition while you were governor and so forth. Now will you finally acknowledge that you made a mistake? In the last year of your term as governor, taking on the most partisan job in America as chairman of the Democratic National Committee, when you had all of this going on in Virginia, do you regret putting the partisan agenda ahead of your responsibilities to the people of Virginia as governor?

KAINE: George, I'm not a hard partisan and I've never been. You can serve with honor in a party role. George H.W. Bush, RNC chair; George Allen, chairman of the Republican Senate Campaign Committee; Bob McDonnell, chairman of the Republican Governors Association, Jim Gilmore Chairman of the Republican National Committee. All of those things were fine with you. What Virginians care about is results. That's what they care about. When Virginians are asked to assume leadership positions it's often because there's something good about Virginia. What Virginians care about is results. And I'm very proud of my results in 2009, the year I was governor and DNC Chair. I was governing in the worse recession since the 1930's. In 2009 we worked together to go a historic

piece of good work, banning smoking in restaurants and bars. Bill Howl my Republican Speaker and I came together after three years to do that. We got the hat trick, all three major publications that identify what is the best state for business in the United States named Virginia as the best state. We brokered the deal first with the Bush administration and completed it with the Obama administration to get 900 million dollars to extend rail to Dulles. We attracted these companies to invest in Virginia, Hilton moved their headquarters here, SCIC moved their headquarters here, Canon and Rolls Royce did major expansions here. Norfolk Grumman called me in my last few days in office saying you've worked on this for four years we're coming from California to the DC area and guess what, Virginia is going to have a great shot at getting this. We made big expansions and improvements and positive achievements in preserving open space and reducing infant mortality and reform sexual violence laws that treat women as second class citizens. That's what I did in 2009 when I was governor, putting Virginia first. Now you had a different track record. You were chair of the Republican Senate Campaign Committee when you were a U.S. Senator. You said when you got elected, my number one job is to elect Republicans. Not be a good senator and number two job elect Republicans, my number one job is to elect Republicans. And during your years, taking that partisan role, increasing deficits, a weakening economy, debt ceiling increases, voting to increase your own pay. These things were happening on your watch when you were Chairman of the Republican Senate Campaign Committee.

CROWLEY: Governor Allen you have 60 seconds to respond

Allen: Yes, when I left the United States Senate um Tim, with the tax cuts we got through, the trajectory towards a balanced budget. The unemployment rate in the United States was 4.4 percent. Nearly half of what it is these days. Tim, you spent the whole quarter last quarter of your term last term as governor rather than giving your full attention to your responsibilities you were giving political speeches all over the country. You were raising tons of money for the Democratic National committee. This is the most partisan job in the country. In fact even in the reports from Freedom of Information Act reports show that half the days in June and October you were not even in Virginia. Now if you want to see what a governor can accomplish when focused on the job, consider governor Bob McDonnell. A year after taking over from Tim, he was able to report this to the people of Virginia. "We have cut \$6 billion from our past two budgets, rejected proposals by my predecessor chairman Tim Kaine to enact the largest tax increase in Virginia history and to produce a \$403 million surplus." I think that says it all. The people of Virginia, they needed a fulltime Governor. But, Tim thought it was more important to serve as a chairman of the Democratic National Committee.

We are at the closing statement time. 2 minutes and by coin toss and Jupiter aligning with Mars, you can give your closing statement Kaine.

Kaine- Thanks Candy. And, thank y'all for coming it is great to back with the Virginia Bar Association and I appreciate this tradition. Look, the 2012 elections here in Virginia and elsewhere are fundamentally elections about tomorrow. They are not about division; they are not about smash-mouth politics. They are about what are the right policies for tomorrow. Old policies won't work. We need new policies to continue to grow the economy and move ahead. In the era of economic policy we have a basic plan that has a couple of key pillars that are rooted in a Virginia experience of, of seeing Virginia through the worst recession since the 1930s and keeping Virginia economically strong. It's about leveling the playing field for small businesses so they are not disadvantaged up against larger businesses. Its about making investments in talent, that's really what has driven Virginia forward. The talent investment that has increased our higher education rate and increased our performance in K-12. Its about infrastructure spending of the kind we talked about on the rail to Dulles. It's about finding balance the right way to our budgets and not the wrong way. We can't go back to the days when George talked about

an American comeback. I don't want to go back. I don't think Virginians want to go back. We can't go back to those days in 2000 and 2006 of no oversight and wasteful spending of fighting innovation. George fought so hard against things like higher cafe standard increases and energy alternative investments. We can't go back. So we have to have the policies that focus on tomorrow or more importantly we have to have the politics that focus on tomorrow. The search for common ground. The refusal to say that compromise is a bad word. The ability to listen not smash mouth politics, not knocking anyone's whiny soft teeth from their whiny throats. Not calling government employees sanctimonious socialists which George does at virtually every occasion. The name calling that is going on now is blocking us from getting things done. We need to have less of it. And, we need to have folks that bring us together and build people up rather than divide them and tear them down.

CROWLEY: And, last words from Governor Allen:

ALLEN: Well thank you for this opportunity to have this debate today about the future of our country. There is a lot at stake in this pivotal election and I think it is the promise of the American Dream for our children and our grandchildren. I think there is a clear choice in this Senate race. I envisioned a much better future than what we're having to endure these days. I believe the way to get our economy moving again and to get our jobs is to reinvigorate the entrepreneurial spirit of our country. We need to be providing Americans with a competitive advantage for investment in jobs. We need to release our American energy resources from our coal fields to our coasts and I think we do need to reign in this over-reaching, over-spending federal government. Here's what we need to be united behind- proven reforms to the world that America is open for business again. Now we can do this, without putting at risk the men and women of our armed services who put their lives on the line to protect our security and our freedom. We can do this without the devastating loss of jobs that will result from this deal my opponent supported. We can do this without the massive tax increases that Time supports on working men and women and small businesses which will only result in more Virginians out of jobs. Now on every single significant issue Tim Kaine has sided with the agenda of President Obama rather than the people of Virginia. I'll be Virginia's voice in Washington. Some people say that the problems are too big and the Republicans and the Democrats can't be brought together to solve them. I believe we can work together. When I was governor we worked with legislators of both parties to get big things done. We can do the same in Washington and there is urgency for action. So I respectfully ask for your support and your help to get America ascending again so that all Americans have that equal opportunity to catch their dreams. Thank you all so much.